

**Notice of Allowability**

Application No.

10/785,982

Examiner

Taylor Victor Oh

Applicant(s)

ISHII ET AL.

Art Unit

1625

**-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address--**

All claims being allowable, PROSECUTION ON THE MERITS IS (OR REMAINS) CLOSED in this application. If not included herewith (or previously mailed), a Notice of Allowance (PTOL-85) or other appropriate communication will be mailed in due course. **THIS NOTICE OF ALLOWABILITY IS NOT A GRANT OF PATENT RIGHTS.** This application is subject to withdrawal from issue at the initiative of the Office or upon petition by the applicant. See 37 CFR 1.313 and MPEP 1308.

1. ☒ This communication is responsive to 4/30/07.
2. ☒ The allowed claim(s) is/are 1-3.
3. ☒ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☒ All b) ☐ Some\* c) ☐ None of the:
- ☒ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this national stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* Certified copies not received: \_\_\_\_\_.

Applicant has THREE MONTHS FROM THE "MAILING DATE" of this communication to file a reply complying with the requirements noted below. Failure to timely comply will result in ABANDONMENT of this application.

**THIS THREE-MONTH PERIOD IS NOT EXTENDABLE.**

4. ☐ A SUBSTITUTE OATH OR DECLARATION must be submitted. Note the attached EXAMINER'S AMENDMENT or NOTICE OF INFORMAL PATENT APPLICATION (PTO-152) which gives reason(s) why the oath or declaration is deficient.
5. ☐ CORRECTED DRAWINGS ( as "replacement sheets") must be submitted.
- (a) ☐ including changes required by the Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review ( PTO-948) attached
- 1) ☐ hereto or 2) ☐ to Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
- (b) ☐ including changes required by the attached Examiner's Amendment / Comment or in the Office action of Paper No./Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_.
- Identifying indicia such as the application number (see 37 CFR 1.84(c)) should be written on the drawings in the front (not the back) of each sheet. Replacement sheet(s) should be labeled as such in the header according to 37 CFR 1.121(d).
6. ☐ DEPOSIT OF and/or INFORMATION about the deposit of BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL must be submitted. Note the attached Examiner's comment regarding REQUIREMENT FOR THE DEPOSIT OF BIOLOGICAL MATERIAL.

**Attachment(s)**

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| 1. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)   | 5. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Informal Patent Application                      |
| 2. <input type="checkbox"/> Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)                       | 6. <input type="checkbox"/> Interview Summary (PTO-413),<br>Paper No./Mail Date _____. |
| 3. <input type="checkbox"/> Information Disclosure Statements (PTO/SB/08),<br>Paper No./Mail Date _____    | 7. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Amendment/Comment                               |
| 4. <input type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Comment Regarding Requirement for Deposit<br>of Biological Material | 8. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Examiner's Statement of Reasons for Allowance   |
|  | 9. <input type="checkbox"/> Other _____.   |

Art Unit: 1625

It is noted that applicants have filed an Amendment after the Final Rejection on 4/30/07; applicants' attorney has addressed the issues of record. The proposed amendment will be entered and the application is now in condition for allowance.

The Status of Claims

Claims 1-3 are pending.

Claims 1-3 are allowable.

Reasons of Allowance

I. The following is an examiner's statement of reasons for allowance:

- The close prior art to the current invention are Asahi et al (US 5,760,288) and Ichikawa et al (US 3,920,734).

Asahi et al teaches a process of producing an aromatic carboxylic acid by oxidizing an aromatic compound having an alkyl group with oxygen containing gas in an aqueous medium in the presence of a catalyst containing a transition metal incorporated into a heteropoly-acid skeleton.

Ichikawa et al discloses a process for producing an aromatic carboxylic acid by reacting an aromatic compound with carbon monoxide and molecular oxygen in the presence of a catalyst containing a palladium carboxylate.

However, the instant invention differs from the prior art in that Ichikawa uses a palladium carboxylate during the process of oxidizing the aromatic compound in the presence of carbon monoxide and oxygen and Ashi uses a transition metal incorporated into a heteropoly-acid skeleton during the process of oxidizing an alkyl group of the aromatic compound in the presence of oxygen unlike the claimed invention which uses the combination of palladium and heteropoly-acid in the presence of carbon monoxide and oxygen; therefore, each of them is involved completely in a different process due to their difference in the reactants and the starting materials and; furthermore, there is a lack of motivation to combine them due to the absence of the common ground of using the same starting material.

Therefore, the claimed invention would not have been obvious to the person with an ordinary skill in the art.

Any comments considered necessary by applicant must be submitted no later than the payment of the issue fee and, to avoid processing delays, should preferably accompany the issue fee. Such submissions should be clearly labeled "Comments on Statement of Reasons for Allowance.

Any inquiry concerning the communication after allowance such as sending all post-allowance correspondence should be directed to "Box Issue Fee" or faxed directly to PUBS at 703-305-8755. This will expedite the process of these papers.

Art Unit: 1625

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

  
TAYLOR VICTOR OH  
PRIMARY EXAMINER

5/9/07